

The regular meeting of the **Historic District Commission** was held on Thursday, April 22, 2021 at 4:00 p.m. in the Board Chambers of Town Hall, 500 Poplar View Parkway.

The following Staff members were present: Development Director, Jay Cravens; Town Planner, Jaime Groce; Assistant Town Planner, Ms. Nancy Boatwright; Planner, Ms. Donquetta Singleton, and Administrative Specialist Sr., Mrs. Shari Michael and Administrative Specialist Sr., Mrs. Sheryl Jones.

Pledge of Allegiance

Commissioner Brooks led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Roll Call:

Chairman Lee asked Mrs. Michael to call the roll to confirm a quorum.

Cox	Todd	Brooks	Walker	Lee	Kelsey	Rozanski
Absent	Absent	Present	Present	Present	Present	Present

Quorum present.

Approval of the Agenda

Chairman Lee asked if there were any changes to the agenda.

Mr. Jaime Groce indicated there was one change to the agenda. Item 6.c-Perkins Subdivision – Applicant had planned to come before the Committee but was turned down last time. So Applicant has asked for a deferral until a future meeting to be able to talk to the neighbors more and do more work on the project. If you would be willing to approve the agenda with the deferral of this case to a future meeting.

Hearing this change request, Chairman Lee called for a motion to approve the agenda with item 6.c. being deferred to a future meeting.

Motion by Commissioner Walker, and seconded, to approve the agenda from the April 22, 2021.

Roll call:

Kelsey	Brooks	Todd	Walker	Rozanski	Cox	Lee
Yes	Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes	Absent	Yes

Motion Approved.

Approval of Minutes

Chairman Lee asked if there were any corrections to the minutes from the March 25, 2021, meeting. It was stated that pages were missing in the minutes for March 25, 2021. A change in wording requested by Kelsey for “A discussion ensued about the fact this was not new construction, but an existing subdivision (change to lot).”

Motion by Commissioner Walker, and seconded, to approve the agenda as published.

Roll call:

Brooks	Todd	Walker	Rozanski	Cox	Kelsey	Lee
Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes

Motion Approved.

Formal Agenda:

6.a Case #73618 – Oakwood, Phase 2 – Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 4-lot residential subdivision on 4.50 acres located at 262 and 276 East Poplar Avenue.

6.b Case#215839 – Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish 3 accessory structures located at 262 and 276 East Poplar Avenue.

- | |
|--|
| EXHIBITS |
| <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Demolition Conditions of Approval (4/16/21) 2. Preliminary Plat Conditions of Approval (4/16/21) 3. Cover Letter (4/6/21) 4. Photos of Structures to be Demolished (4/6/21) 5. Excerpt from Historic Guidelines Regarding Demolitions 6. Oakwood, Final Plat (1999) 7. Oakwood, Phase 2 Preliminary Plat (March 2021) 8. Oakwood, Phase 2 Tree Plan (March 2021) |

Mr. Jaime Groce gave the Staff presentation. He explained that the property is zoned R-1 and they plan to keep it R-1. The whole property is within the Historic Overlay. Oakwood Phase 1 was developed in 1999. There was a stub planned for Ellawood Lane to be extended in Oakwood and that would be the access for two of the lots in the subdivision. The applicant submitted a rezoning request last year to rezone this property to R-2a and a second lot configuration. The rezoning is still pending but is inactive and has come forward with a 4 lot subdivision instead of 7 lots. The Planning Commission did not recommend approval. They are presenting the 4 lot to you today. In Oakwood Phase 2, they plan to keep two houses fronting on Poplar Ave. The two new lots (Lot #s 3 and 4) are both larger than 1 acre in size and will share a private drive/turnaround at the terminus of Ellawood Lane. The two Poplar driveways plan to maintain the historic context along the lots. The two lots on Poplar Avenue will have larger setbacks than typical trying to maintain the historic context. They show on the plan 100 feet setbacks but it averages more like 90 feet, therefore needing a condition of approval to change the front setback from 100 feet to 90 feet. They plan to bring the houses a little closer to the road. Ellawood Lane would not be extended and have no direct connection to Poplar Avenue. The two houses that are there turned 50 not long ago. It is unclear if they have any historic significance or not. This lot has a lot of trees and each one acre lot will be bigger in size. The two houses have not been studied. One was built in 1960 and the other in 1965. It is unclear if they have any historic significance or not. This property has a lot of trees on it. Each lot is one acre in size. There are plans to demolish the existing houses. The house on the two lots will remain. Each new house to be built according to the historic conditions.

Mr. Jaime Groce explained to the HDC about the demolition of 3 accessory structures in the rear. One is a large structure and the other two are smaller structures on Poplar. Structure no. 2 is on blocks, they may want to move it instead of demolish it. They have asked that we allow for that in the conditions. There are two separate motions, one is for the accessory structures and motion no. 2 is for the subdivision layout.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions for Staff.

Chairman Lee inquired about the front setback. He clarified that the only reason to request a 90 feet setback is if, in the future, new construction would not have to comply with such a setback.

Mr. Groce stated that is correct.

Hearing no questions for Staff, Chairman Lee asked for the applicant to come forward.

The applicant, Rob Smith of 182 W. Poplar Avenue, said he was available for questions.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Rozanski, and seconded, to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness to demolish 3 accessory structures located at 262 and 276 East Poplar Avenue with the revised conditions:

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. Demolition is only appropriate for the three (3) structures described in Exhibit 3. Relocation of Structure #2 is appropriate provided that it is not placed in a required side yard, set back at least 5 feet from any other structures, and set back from the nearest property line at least a distance equal to the height of the structure.
2. Demolition permits shall be obtained from the Building Official prior to any demolition.
3. The property shall be seeded or sodded, as appropriate, within 60 days of demolition to create a lawn area similar to other properties in the community.
4. Any changes/deviations from the conditions of approval will require HDC approval.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a roll call.

Roll call:

Brooks	Todd	Walker	Rozanski	Cox	Kelsey	Lee
Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes

Motion approved.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Walker, and seconded, to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 4-lot residential subdivision on 4.50 acres located at 262 and 276 East Poplar Avenue.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. The front yard setback of Lot #s 1 and 2 shall be 90 feet, not 100 feet, based on the average front setbacks of houses to the west.
2. Only two (2) lots shall be allowed to access Ellawood Lane.
3. Any changes/deviations from the lot layout, building envelopes, or conditions of approval will require HDC approval.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a roll call.

Roll call:

Todd	Walker	Rozanski	Cox	Kelsey	Brooks	Lee
absent	yes	yes	Absent	yes	yes	yes

Motion approved.

6.c Case#215168 – Perkins Subdivision - Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 2-lot residential subdivision on 1.20 acres at 369 West Poplar Avenue.

Request by applicant to Defer to a later meeting was granted.

6.d Case#215705 – 251 College Street – Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations.

Chairman Lee reminded the audience if you care to speak, fill out a speaker card and bring to the front, as I have one blue card already.

Ms. Nancy Boatwright presented the staff report. Applicant is requesting Certificate of Appropriateness for the 1,886 square foot residence at 251 College Street. The property is not eligible for the National Register according to the 2004 Historic Survey. The double gable will go above the front entry door. The 477 square foot addition kitchen and keeping room and open porch will be on the southeast corner of the existing residence. All the windows and door locks will be replaced. All multi-pane windows will be three over one and will be no rot, faux wood simulated divided light. A 6' by 6', 9-light picture window will replace the two windows on the front elevation. This will require removal of some of the brick. The noncompliant shutters will be removed. The application includes a proposal to paint the brick White Duck. The Guidelines say that painting unpainted brick is inappropriate on historic structures, if painted then select a color that matches the existing brick. The HDC has weighed the long-term impacts to the historic resource and district, which is their ultimate charge. Aesthetics alone is not the charge of the HDC. Staff has prepared a memo that summarizes the discussions of the HDC recently on how they plan to address reoccurring requests to paint brick that are unpainted. Those items that structure should not be painted unless they clearly do not have historic significance or have already been painted. It would not be appropriate to paint the brick portions of the residence until the 2020 Historic Resource Survey is completed and that is a suggested condition of approval. There are other modifications. The map shows that 251 College Street and the houses with red dots are unpainted brick built before 1978 and typically not appropriate to paint such a structure in that class.

- | EXHIBITS | |
|-----------------|----------------------------------|
| 1. | Conditions of Approval (4/16/21) |
| 2. | Cover Letter (3/30/21) |
| 3. | Materials & Colors (3/30/21) |
| 4. | 2004 Historic Survey |
| 5. | Painted Brick Memo (4/15/21) |
| 6. | Architectural Plans (4/9/21) |

There are other modifications to replace the lap siding in the front gable with cedar shake siding and painted Repose Gray to match the proposed window color. Also a new terra cotta chimney cap will replace the existing cap. Also to obtain a building permit for the addition.

A commissioner asked if the house is on the National Register of Historic Places and Mrs. Boatwright confirmed that it is not. By this Fall, we should have the results of the 2020 Historic Resource Survey and know if the structure is eligible or not for the National Register.

Commissioner Kelsey asked about the use of cedar shingles on this mid-century building. Commissioner asked about the light pattern of the windows.

Chairman Lee asked if there were any questions for Staff.

Hearing no questions for Staff, Chairman Lee asked for the applicant to come forward.

The applicant, Daryl Darnall of 466 Mockingbird Lane, addressed the HDC. Mr. Darnall stated the window pattern is not a big deal and if he cannot paint the brick that will be fine. The brick is beautiful the way it is and agrees with all of the conditions of approval.

Commissioner Rozanski asked about the type of siding and condition 2.

Mr. Darnall stated it may be aluminum siding on there now and could be replaced with hardi-plank.

Ms. Boatwright indicated the siding in question for Condition no. 2 is on the east side elevation.

Mr. Tom Webb, 277 College Street. He came to support Mr. Darnall and is a neighbor and want to thank Mr. Darnall for having the vision to fix the home up and not let it become a rental property. There are rental properties on College Street all the time. His neighbor at 261 College Street is a painted remodeled home.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a motion.

Motion by Commissioner Rozanski, and seconded, to approve to add Condition 6 change the cedar shake on the front to match the lap siding on the house Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior alterations.

A discussion ensued about dividing the double gables, putting a new gable on would transfer the porch to the front door, taking out the two double windows on the left-hand side, and adding another single mirror image of the window giving a nice appeal at the front door.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. Any deviations from the approved Certificate of Appropriateness shall require the approval of the HDC and/or staff prior to beginning work.
2. The lap siding shall be wood or fiber cement.
3. The entire foundation for the addition shall be clad in brick veneer.
4. The porch support columns shall be wood, a wood composite or fiber cement material.
5. The brick structure shall not be painted. A re-application will be required to request to paint the brick.
6. The cedar shake siding in the front gable shall be changed to wood or fiber cement lap siding.

Hearing no further comments Chairman Lee asked for a roll call.

Roll call:

Brooks	Todd	Walker	Rozanski	Cox	Kelsey	Lee
Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes	Absent	Yes	Yes

Motion approved.

Other Business

Chairman Lee asked if there was any other business.

Mr. Groce mentioned that the Mayor and Board will meet on 4/26/21 to hire a consultant to study all the structures in town 50 years or older, to assess every structure. It should be a great tool for the HDC. Thomason and Associates submitted a contract for the survey work. They did a similar survey in Franklin, TN. A final report should be ready in September or October to present to the HDC.

Mr. Groce met with Mark Underwood who donated some time to help upgrade the directional “wayfinding” signage around the Historic District to help point visitors to more parking. He plans to walk the area with him to come up with a 100% plan that can be turned over to the Town Administrator for review and approval. The plans will be brought to the HDC for review and, if it works, the Town and Main Street Collierville will figure out ways to pay for it. Part of the plan will be to take down old signs that are not useful anymore.

There was discussion about a potential single-family development at 160 E. Poplar Avenue (Applicant: John McCarty, PE). Mr. John McCarty of 198 Progress Road, Collierville, TN asked the HDC for nonbinding feedback on a project that has been submitted. They are working with the existing home at 160 Poplar, a white brick house, and the two lots are there. The house has been added onto at least once or twice. He has a concept to get feedback on tonight and wants their input on a rezoning to TN, the demolition of existing structure, and a 5-lot plat.

Mr. McCarty said they would have two lots on Poplar, the house straddles it. The original structure was built smaller and then they expanded it and bought the lot next door and put across the property line.

Also proposing to have two lots on Poplar with a separation of 24 feet between the two structures, the existing house is 5 feet off the property line. The new structure would be about 45 feet from the house to the west (pink house). He plans to stop the back lot line at about 135 or 140 feet deep off Poplar. They would have shared driveways using the existing driveway, with the driveway going between the two houses to provide the separation. The proposed plan in the back is a cottage plan. There are two small cottage houses on North Main working with those owners to acquire the strip of land necessary to provide a driveway to come in. He spoke with Fire Marshall, who says he does not need a full legal turnaround at the end. His thought is 20-foot shared driveway for the three cottages in the back. The two houses on North Main are also looking to redesign and upgrade them some.

He plans it to be a nice 5-lot cottage enclave that would function well. This is a good development to add to the District.

Commissioner Walker looked at one of the houses but walked away. It seems like a good idea.

Commissioner Rozanski agreed with the cul-da-sac on the end. How much discussion have you had with the homeowners? Limiting access to just Main Street for the 3 cottages is a good idea.

Commissioner Lee asked if he's had discussions with property owners to the east or west.

The applicant said no.

Commissioner Lee asked about building setbacks and the spacing between houses on Poplar Avenue.

Commissioner Brooks liked the idea/concept. It is a totally different flow. She would like to hear from the neighbors.

A discussion ensued about how to limit access to Poplar Avenue. The applicant said they plan to use the existing driveway and put the garages in the back. There will not be an alley behind these lots. They will use a side loaded garage and then connect the driveway around the structures to have better access.

A discussion ensued about this project being on the HDC agenda in May and the applicant's next steps with the neighbors.

Chairman Lee asked Ms. Boatwright if there were any other items.

Ms. Boatwright introduced Ms. Sheryl Jones to replace Ms. Shari Michael. Ms. Michael is retiring in less than 30 days.

With no further business, Chairman Lee adjourned the meeting at 5:02 p.m.

Secretary, Laura Todd